

УДК: 7.034.450.6: 7.041.5

ББК: 85.143(3)

DOI: 10.18688/aa2111-06-47

R. R. Kholev

Interpreting Pontormo's *Halberdier*: Francesco Guardi or Cosimo I de' Medici?

In 1989, the collection of the J. Paul Getty Museum was enriched by a portrait of a young man in a soldier dress with a halberd, painted by Jacopo Pontormo (Ill. 134). The work, which is called the *Portrait of a Halberdier*, became one of the most discussed Florentine portraits of the Cinquecento. The dispute concerns the identification of the Pontormo's model. There are two candidates: the first one is Cosimo I de' Medici, the Duke of Florence (1537–1569) and the Grand Duke of Tuscany (1569–1574); the second one is the Florentine noble Francesco Guardi, the defender of the Florence during the Siege in 1529–1530, whose name is not that famous in the history of 16th century Florence. The identification of the young halberdier as either Cosimo I or Francesco Guardi is a key to date (1529/1530 for Francesco or late 1530s for Cosimo I) and interpret the Pontormo's portrait. In Cosimo's case, the portrait refers to the triumph of the Medici dynasty in the person of young Duke as the absolute ruler of Florence. In Francesco Guardi's case, the halberdier symbolizes the struggle of Florentine republic against the encroachment of the Medici supported by Spanish troops of Charles V, the King of Spain (1516–1556) and the Holy Roman Emperor (1519–1556). The article aims to methodize different approaches to identify the young halberdier, to reconsider the recent studies on this subject, and to analyze, why the Pontormo's portrait admits directly opposing interpretations.

Before appearing in the Getty Museum, the *Portrait of a halberdier* passed through a number of French and American collections where it was generally considered as Bronzino's portrait of a young man¹. In 1920, Hermann Voss attributed the *Halberdier* to Pontormo on the basis of the stylistic analysis [25, p. 175]. Voss was also the first who suggested to identify the young soldier as Francesco Guardi, according to *The Lives* of Giorgio Vasari. In the account of Pontormo's life, Vasari mentioned the portrait of Francesco Guardi in the costume of a soldier that Pontormo had painted during the siege of Florence². However, the Voss' attribution was not supported by colleagues because Francesco Guardi, the only one known to history, was born in 1466 [5, p. 8]. Obviously, this person could not be painted on the portrait of the 16th century that represented a young man no older than twenty years old. The new suggestion about the model for the halberdier's portrait was proposed in 1959 by Herbert Keutner who published the newfound inventory of the Riccardi collection. The Riccardi, originally from Pisa, was in the service of the Medici dukes. The 1612 inventory of their collection included the description of the *Halberdier*

¹ For *Halberdier's* provenance and bibliography, see [18, pp. 431–433].

² "Ritrasso similmente, nel tempo dell'assedio di Fiorenza, Francesco Guardi in abito di soldato, che fu opera bellissima..." [23, p. 282].

that was located in the Riccardi's palazzo Valfonda in Florence. This description, which is the first documentary reference of the portrait, confirmed the Pontormo's authorship of *Halberdier* and identified the model as "the Most Excellent Duke Cosimo when he was young"³.

The inventory of the Riccardi collection became a powerful argument to regard the young halberdier as the representation of the Duke Cosimo I de' Medici, whose persona has never been considered in this regard before. In this case, the portrait should be dated circa 1537, Cosimo's first year of rule when he was about 18 years old. The first portraits of the Duke after coming to power, namely Pontormo's drawing (1537; Florence, Uffizi) and Baccio Bandinelli's marble relief (c. 1537; Florence, Collection Giuseppe Pacini), represent beardless Cosimo. Since the late 1530s, however, Duke has always been portrayed with a beard. The Bandinelli's marble bust of *Cosimo I de' Medici* (c. 1539–1540; New York, The Metropolitan museum) and the allegorical *Portrait of Cosimo de' Medici as Orpheus*, (c. 1539; Philadelphia Museum of Art) painted by Agnolo Bronzino for Cosimo's marriage to Eleonora di Toledo in 1539, represented the young Duke already with a thin beard.

The obvious way to confirm or refute the identification of a young halberdier as Cosimo I is to compare the Pontormo's portrait with other portraits of the Duke. The Cosimo's appearance can be clearly conceived by means of numerous portraits which represent Duke between the ages of 12 and about 40. There are, in particular, Ridolfo Ghirlandai's *Portrait of Cosimo de' Medici at age twelve* (1531; Florence, Palazzo Medici-Riccardi), *all'antica* busts of Cosimo sculpted by Baccio Bandinelli and Benvenuto Cellini (Florence, Bargello), Agnolo Bronzino's *Portrait of Cosimo I de' Medici in armour*, (1545; Florence, Uffizi) which is known in over twenty copies by Bronzino and his atelier. Cosimo's distinct facial features, which have been represented in different portraits, are a long hawk nose, a small mouth with narrow upper and wide lower lips, and a strong chin. These features are typical for the portrait renderings of other members of the Medici dynasty (for example, Botticelli's *Portrait of Giuliano Medici*). Pontormo reproduced the "Medici traits" in his historical *Portrait of Cosimo the Elder* (c. 1519; Florence, Uffizi).

The *Halberdier's* face considerably differs from Cosimo's portraitse. However, the differences between halberdier's and Cosimo's features can be explained by the idealizing the character of Pontormo's work. The young men in Pontormo's portraits (such as *Portrait of Furrier* (1517–1518; Paris, Louvre), *Portrait of young man in pink* (1525–1526; Lucca, Pinacoteca Comunale), *Portrait of a man in a red cap* (1530; London, National Gallery) and *Portrait of a Halberdier* itself) have large and close-set eyes, small mouth with full lips, curly hair, delicate features, and a slim body. The same type of beauty is also found in Pontormo's religious painting: Elisabeth Cropper [5, p. 12] noted the similarity between the faces of young halberdier and angels in the *Deposition from the Cross* painted by Pontormo for Capponi Chapel (1526–1528; Florence, Santa Felicita). Thus the *Halberdier* could represent the image of *bella gioventù* than reproduce the model's features. Moreover, the idealized character of the model encouraged to see in Pontormo's portrait influence of classic imagery of heroic youth, including an iconog-

³ "Un ritratto... si crede di mano di d.^o Jac.^o dell'Ecc.^{mo} Duca Cosimo quand'era giovanetto, con calze rosse, e berretta rossa, et una picca in mano con arme a' canto, e giubbone bianco, e collana al'collo con ornam.^{to} dorato bellissimo..." [15, p. 152].

raphy of young Octavius, the future emperor Octavian August [11, p.88], and *Saint George* of Donatello [5, p. 84].

To sum up, there are not conclusive arguments to identify the young man as Cosimo I by comparison with Duke's portrait imagery. The new conclusions on the *Halberdier's* identification came from the iconological analysis. Pontormo's portrait represents a wide field for interpretations based on numerous attributes, including a soldier uniform of a young man, his halberd and hat badge with the image of Hercules fighting with Antaeus, and a bastion in the background.

The first approach to interpret the iconography of Pontormo's portrait was suggested in 1971 by Kurt Forster who accepted the attribution of the Riccardi inventory and considered the halberdier as Duke Cosimo [11]. Heir of a junior branch of the Medici family, Cosimo became the ruler of Florence in January 1537 after the murder of Duke Alessandro I de' Medici. At first, the young *capo* did not enjoy the confidence of the emperor Charles V who did not officially confirm his ducal title. At the same time, Florence has been attacked by the army of *fuorusciti* led by Strozzi, the ancient enemy of the Medici. Cosimo's victory during the battle of Montemurlo in August 1537 brought an end to the anti-medicean march and granted the Duke the favour of the Emperor. Cosimo pursued a policy based on the consolidation of his power and the creation of the absolute ruler image⁴. In 1542, the Duke moved from his official residence to the Palazzo Vecchio, one of the most important symbols of the Florentine Republic. According to Forster, "the huge bastion looming in the background is a reference to Cosimo's expressed claim to independent authority over the Florentine fortresse" [11, p. 73]. In that interpretation, the portrait can be referred to Bronzino's *Portrait of Cosimo I de' Medici as Orpheus* which represents Duke quieting Cerberus by his poetry [21].

More powerful argument to identify a young halberdier as Cosimo I is the golden hat badge with the image of Hercules slaying Antaeus. The imagery of the famous Greek hero and his Labours was an important part of Medici allegorical representation. In the 1470s, Antonio del Pollaiuolo executed for the Medici three paintings of *Labours of Hercules* (associated with *Hercules and the Hydra*, *Hercules and Antaeus*, Florence, Uffizi) and a bronze sculpture of *Hercules and Antaeus* (Florence, Bargello). In *Cinquecento*, the group *Hercules and Cacus*, sculpted by Baccio Bandinelli and placed in front of the palazzo Vecchio four years after the restoration of Medici power in Florence, became a symbol of the dynasty triumph.

The image of Hercules as a personification of force had a significant role in the representation of Cosimo I⁵. In 1537, the first year of Cosimo's rule, Domenico di Polo executed a medal with a portrait of the Duke in armour on the obverse and a scene of Hercules slaying Antaeus on the reverse. The victory over the mythic giant, held aloft by Hercules, could be referred to Cosimo's triumph over Strozzi and other *fuorusciti*, exiled from Florence. The Duke was sculpted, painted, and portrayed on medals directly as a Greek demi-god or with his attributes. For example, the engraving of Niccolo della Casa from Baccio Bandinelli's drawing (1544; New York, Metropolitan museum) represents Cosimo with a lion skin, bow, sword and shield; Duke's armour is decorated with scenes of Labours (Hercules carrying Nemean lion and Erymanthian

⁴ The cultural politics of Cosimo I de' Medici has been the subject of numerous studies. See [2; 8; 6].

⁵ For Cosimo's representation as Hercules, see [19, pp.79-106].

Boar, Hercules fighting Lernaean Hydra). Cosimo's political doings were eventually compared to Hercules' Labours. Vasari mentioned twelve medals of Pietro Paolo Galeotti representing the most significant cultural and political doings of Duke [24, p. 543].

Forster's identification of halberdier as young Duke Cosimo, based on the inventory of the Riccardi collection, was generally accepted by scholars. In 1981, Karla Langedijk included Pontormo's work in her monumental monograph on Medici portraits [18]. Few years later, Getty museum purchased the *Halberdier* as a portrait of Cosimo I de' Medici. The catalogue for the sale comprising arguments in favour of identification of the young halberdier as Duke Cosimo was prepared by Janet Cox-Rearick [5, p. 9].

The new suggestion about the *Halberdier* was made in the 1990s. Luciano Berti returned to earlier Voss' idea to identify the young man as Francesco Guardi, defender of Florence at the time of the Siege in 1529–1530 [1]. This proposal, based on *The Lives* of Vasari, was made possible after the discovery of another Francesco Guardi who was born in 1514. Berti's article was supported by Elisabeth Cropper. The result of her iconological study was a brilliant monograph published in 1997 [5].

Cropper proposed another reading of halberdier's attributes, much different from the Forster's interpretations. She proposed that the green fortification wall behind the model should represent one of the bastions of San Miniato al Monte, which had been built by Michelangelo during the Siege. This suggestion is based on the fact that the Guardi had a property nearby the Monte San Miniato. In Cropper's interpretation, Pontormo coded Francesco's name into the portrait. The young man from the *Guardi del Monte* family is represented before the bastion as the *guardio del monte*. Moreover, the *guardio Francesco* was a literal embodiment of the *guardia del Monte* established by Signoria in the face of hostile force [5, p. 80]. Hence, the halberdier in Pontormo's idealized portrait appears as a defender of Florentine Republic and his own property against Spanish troops.

Hercules slaying Antaeus on halberdier's hat badge is also interpreted by Elisabeth Cropper as an anti-medicean symbol. The image of Hercules was an important part of Florentine republican culture. The author cited as example Michelangelo's drawings for the sculpture of Hercules and Antaeus [5, p. 70]. This unrealized sculptural group, commissioned to Michelangelo by Signoria in 1508, should flank the entry of the Palazzo Vecchio with his statue of *David*. After the republican government's defeat in Florence, Medici transmitted the commission to Baccio Bandinelli, who was close to the Popes Leo X and Clement VII. The sculptor refused the story of Hercules and Antaeus, which should keep anti-medicean connotations, and represented the victory of Hercules over Cacus.

The conclusions of Elisabeth Cropper were accepted by the Getty Museum which reattributed Pontormo's work as a portrait of Francesco Guardi (1529/1530). However, the new approach to *Halberdier's* identification was proposed by scholars in the 2010s. The article *Who was Pontormo's Halberdier? The evidence from pathology* produced an anatomical study to identify the young soldier [26]. It claims that the left hand of the model was severely deformed. The authors revealed pathological anomalies of the proximal interphalangeal (PIP), the distal interphalangeal (DIP) and the metacarpo-phalangeal (MP) joints of the four fingers of halberdier's left hand. The PIP joints are swollen and flexed, while the MP joints are depressed; the DIP joints are also extended. The same deformities were also discovered on the right hand of Bronz-

ino's *Cosimo de' Medici in Armour* (Ill. 135). The anatomical resemblance between two models made it possible to identify the *Halberdier* as Duke Cosimo [26, p. 1917]. The suggestion was indirectly confirmed by the fact that Cosimo had numerous arthritic changes as his mother Maria Salviati, the granddaughter of Lorenzo the Magnificent, belonged to the senior Medici branch, which suffered from a psoriatic DISH-arthropathy; Cosimo's).

The conclusion, based on anatomical study, seems arguable. If Pontormo's and Bronzino's portraits represent the same model, the right hand of halberdier should be also deformed, but it has no visible pathologies. Moreover, some of Cosimo's portraits as Ghirlandai's *Portrait of Cosimo de' Medici at age twelve* or Bronzino's *Portrait of Cosimo* at the age of forty do not demonstrate equal anatomical deformities of his left or right hand. These observations correspond to the fact that the accurate examination of Cosimo's small bones of hands revealed no signs of erosive arthritis but only post-mortal damages [10, pp. 3699–3700].

In the 1530s, Bronzino painted the *Portrait of a young man with a book* (Ill. 136). Pontormo's pupil, the painter reproduced in this portrait the composition and sitter's pose of the *Halberdier*. Moreover, Bronzino's model had the same finger joints' pathologies as the *Halberdier* and later *Cosimo de' Medici in Armour*. The similarity between the hands' defects led the authors to conclude that the *young man with a book* also represented the Florentine Duke. This interpretation, based only on anatomical resemblance, can be however contested.

The X-radiograph analysis⁶ shows that the painter significantly changed the palazzo's interior behind the model and corrected the figure. Reworking the portrait, Bronzino remade considerably the left hand of the sitter. Following the *Halberdier's* hand, the index and the middle fingers were joined, and the PIP joints were swollen. These changes argue in favour of its deliberate nature. The models in Florentine court portraits of the 16th century were often represented with physical pathologies. Bronzino's art is an example. Strabismus was featured in Cosimo's imagery. Firstly painted by Bronzino in the *Portrait of Cosimo de' Medici as Orpheus*, it became the part of Duke's official imagery in *Portrait of Cosimo de' Medici in Armour*. Robert B. Simon considered this defect as a sign of distinction and beauty [20, p. 535]. Besides Duke's portraiture, strabismus was also characteristic of some Florentine nobles⁷. In this context, the hand's deformity of Bronzino's *young man with a book* and later Cosimo de' Medici portraits could be adopted by the painter from Pontormo's *Halberdier* as anatomical feature accentuating the uniqueness and the beauty of the model. So, the pathology of halberdier's left hand cannot be taken as an incontestable argument to consider the model as young Cosimo I de' Medici.

In summing up, the iconological analysis is the most convincing way to identify the young halberdier. As demonstrated by the studies of Kurt Forster and Elisabeth Cropper, the iconography of Pontormo's portrait allows either medicean or anti-medicean interpretations. This ambivalence can be explained by the character of Florentine court culture of the 16th century which formed in the Duchy during the rule of Cosimo I de' Medici. Duke's official portraiture appealed to Roman imperial reminiscences (busts *all' antica*, iconography of Octavian August)

⁶ The X-radiograph photos of Bronzino's *Portrait of a young man with a book* are available at <https://www.metmuseum.org/art/collection/search/435802> (accessed 21 January 2021).

⁷ There are, for example, *Portrait of Bartolomeo Panciatici* (1540; Florence, Uffizi), *Portrait of a man holding a statuette* (1545; Paris, Louvre), *Portrait of Ludovico Capponi* (1551; Frick collection, New York).

and antique mythology (Cosimo's imagery as god or demi-god)⁸. Some of these symbols and attributes could also be associated with Florentine history and its republican culture. Besides Hercules' imagery, it was the lion's theme of Cosimo's representation which was connected to Medici's attributes, Florentine *Marzocco* lion, Nemean lion's skin and Roman emperor's imagery. Moreover, ancient Florentine symbols could change its original republican meaning in the new absolutist culture. Michelangelo's *David*, commanded by republican government and placed in the *Piazza della Signoria*, was built into the context of monarchic Medici rule after moving of the ducal residence to the Palazzo Vecchio and the appearance of two "Medici" giants — Bandinelli's *Hercules and Cacus* and Bartolomeo Ammanati's *Fountain of Neptune*.

In our opinion, the iconological analysis proposed by Elisabeth Cropper is the most conclusive approach to identify Pontormo's *Portrait of a Halberdier* as the portrait of Francesco Guardi painted in 1529 or 1530. The ambivalence of Florentine court culture can justify the possible mistake of Riccardi inventory which defined the *Halberdier* as Cosimo I de' Medici thirty years after the Duke's death. However, the debate about the *Halberdier* favours the broadening of the methodological arsenal, which can be used for the attribution and the interpretation of the 16th-century Florentine portraits, including portraits of the Medici.

References

1. Berti L. L'Alabardiere del Pontormo. *Critica d'arte*, 1990, no. 55, pp. 39–49 (in Italian).
2. Booth C. *Cosimo I, Duke of Florence*. Cambridge, The University Press Publ., 1921. 325 p.
3. Cox-Rearick J. *Dynasty and Destiny in Medici Art: Pontormo, Leo X and the Two Cosimos*. Princeton, Princeton University Press Publ., 1984. 474 p.
4. Cox-Rearick J. Power-Dressing at the Courts of Cosimo de' Medici and François I. *Artibus et Historiae*, 2009, vol. 30, no. 60, pp. 39–69.
5. Cropper E. *Pontormo: Portrait of a Halberdier*. Los Angeles, Getty Museum Publ., 1997. 138 p.
6. Davies J. *Culture and Power: Tuscany and its Universities, 1537–1609*. Leiden, Brill Publ., 2009. 361 p.
7. Eclercy B. (ed.). *Maniera: Pontormo, Bronzino and Medici Florence*. Munich; London; New York, Prestel Publ., 2016. 280 p.
8. Eisenbichler K. *The Cultural Politics of Duke Cosimo I de' Medici*. Vermont, Ashgare Publ., 2001. 262 p.
9. Falciani C.; Natali A. (ed.). *Pontormo and Rosso Fiorentino. Diverging Path of Mannerism*. Firenze, Mandragora Publ., 2014. 372 p.
10. Fornaciari G. Left or Right Hand of Cosimo I de' Medici? *Rheumatology International*, 2012, no. 32 (11), pp. 3699–3700.
11. Forster K. W. Metaphors of Rule. Political Ideology and History in the Portraits of Cosimo I de' Medici. *Mitteilungen des Kunsthistorischen Institutes in Florenz*, 1971, vol. 15, pp. 65–114.
12. Henk van Veen Th. *Letteratura artistica e arte di corte nella Firenze granducale: studi vari*. Florence, Istituto universitario olandese di storia dell'arte Publ., 1986. 170 p. (in Italian).
13. Henk van Veen Th. Republicanism in the Visual Propaganda of Cosimo I De' Medici. *Journal of Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, 1992, no. 55, pp. 200–209.
14. Henk van Veen Th. *Cosimo I de' Medici and His Self-Representation in Florentine Art and Culture*. Cambridge, Cambridge University Publ., 2006. 266 p.
15. Keutner H. Zu einigen Bildnissen des frühen Florentiner Manierismus. *Mitteilungen des Kunsthistorischen Institutes in Florenz*, 1959, vol. 8, pp. 139–154 (in German).
16. Kroke A. F. Cosimo I de' Medici et l'idéalisation du prince par la littérature et les arts. *Le miroir et l'espace du prince dans l'art italien de la Renaissance*. Tours, Presses universitaires François-Rabelais Publ., 2012, pp. 219–253 (in French).

⁸ For Cosimo's representation in Florentine art and its political meaning, see also [14].

17. Langedijk K. Baccio Bandinelli's Orpheus: A Political Message. *Mitteilungen des Kunsthistorischen Institutes in Florenz*, 1976, vol. 20, pp. 33–52.
18. Langedijk K. *The Portraits of the Medici, 15th–18th Centuries, vol. 1*. Florence, Studio Per Edizioni Scelte Publ., 1981. 482 p.
19. Richelson P. W. *Studies in the Personal Imagery of Cosimo I de' Medici, Duke of Florence*. Princeton, Princeton University Publ., 1973. 178 p.
20. Simon R. B. Bronzino's Portrait of Cosimo I in Armour. *The Burlington Magazine*, 1983, vol. 125, no. 966, pp. 527–539.
21. Simon R. B. Bronzino's "Cosimo I de' Medici as Orpheus". *Philadelphia Museum of Art Bulletin*, 1985, vol. 81, no. 348, pp. 16–27.
22. Strehlke C. B. (ed.). *The Transformation of the Renaissance Portrait in Florence*. Philadelphia, Philadelphia Museum of Art Publ., 2004. 173 p.
23. Vasari G.; Milanesi G. *Le Vite de' piu Eccellenti Pittori, Scultori ed Architetti, vol. 6*. Florence, G. S. Sansoni Publ., 1881. 662 p. (in Italian).
24. Vasari G.; Milanesi G. *Le Vite de' piu Eccellenti Pittori, Scultori ed Architetti, vol. 7*. Florence, G. S. Sansoni Publ., 1881. 471 p. (in Italian).
25. Voss H. *Die Malerei der Spätrenaissance in Rom und Florenz, vol. 1*. Berlin, G. Grote Publ., 1920. 294 p. (in German).
26. Weisz G. M.; Albury W. R.; Lippi D.; Matucci-Cerinic M. Who Was Pontormo's Halberdier? The Evidence from Pathology. *Rheumatology International*, 2011, no. 32 (7), pp. 1915–1920.

Title. Interpreting Pontormo's *Halberdier*: Francesco Guardi or Cosimo I de' Medici?

Author. Kholev, Roman Ruslanovich — Ph. D. student. Moscow State University, Leninskie Gory, 1, 119991, Moscow, Russian Federation. kholeff@gmail.com ORCID: 0000-0001-9487-5438

Abstract. Jacopo Pontormo's *Portrait of a Halberdier* is one of the most discussed Florentine portraits of the Cinquecento. The dispute concerns the identification of the model which is interpreted as the Florentine noble Francesco Guardi, defender of the Florentine Republic struggling against the Medici during the Siege in 1529–1530, or the Duke Cosimo I de' Medici. This article aims to methodize different approaches to identify the young halberdier represented in historiography, to evaluate recent studies on this subject and to analyze why the Pontormo's portrait admits directly opposing monarchic (Cosimo de' Medici) and republican (Francesco Guardi) interpretations. The study is based on the analysis of Florentine court culture formed in the 16th century and the representation of Duke Cosimo de' Medici in the Florentine art. As a result, the author distinguished the iconological and the anatomical approaches proposed by scholars to identify Pontormo's *Halberdier*. The anatomical study, which identified the halberdier as Cosimo I in reason of their similar hands' deformities, is criticized. Duke's pathology, depicted in some of Bronzino's portraits, is considered as a sign of beauty and uniqueness adopted by the painter from Pontormo's portrait. The author supported Elisabeth Cropper's interpretation, which considered the sitter as Francesco Guardi. The iconological ambivalence of the portrait permitting its medicean and anti-medicean interpretations is explained by the nature of Florentine court culture and Cosimo's representation, which assimilated ancient republican symbols of Florence and used it to glorify the Duke and the Medici dynasty.

Keywords: portrait, Florence, Renaissance, mannerism, iconology, Pontormo, halberdier, Cosimo, Medici

Название статьи. «Юноша с алебардой» кисти Якопо Понтормо: Франческо Гварди или Козимо I Медичи?

Сведения об авторе. Холев Роман Русланович — аспирант. Московский государственный университет имени М. В. Ломоносова, Ленинские горы, 1, Москва, Российская Федерация, 119991. kholeff@gmail.com ORCID: 0000-0001-9487-5438

Аннотация. В историографии, сложившейся вокруг «Портрета юноши с алебардой» кисти Якопо Понтормо, главное место отведено проблеме идентификации изображённой художником модели. Согласно одной из версий, на портрете изображён Франческо Гварди, один из защитников республиканской Флоренции во время осады города испанскими войсками в 1529–1530-х гг. Другая гипотеза отождествляет юношу с флорентийским герцогом Козимо I Медичи. В статье предпринята попытка систематизировать различные подходы к идентификации модели, дать оценку последним исследованиям и ответить на вопрос, каким образом портрет Понтормо допускает прямо противоположные республиканские (Франческо Гварди) и монархические (Козимо I) интерпретации. Исследование опирается

на анализ флорентийской придворной культуры XVI в. и портретной иконографии герцога Козимо I Медичи. В статье выделены иконологический и анатомический подходы к определению личности алебардиста. Автором критикуется попытка идентифицировать юношу как герцога Козимо на основе схожих патологических изменений в структуре кистей рук, изображённых на «Портрете алебардиста» и «Портрете Козимо I в доспехах» работы Аньоло Бронзино. Анатомические дефекты правой кисти Козимо, изображённые на ряде портретов Бронзино, расценены как умышленный знак красоты и исключительности, заимствованный из «Портрета юноши с алебардой». Автор поддерживает выводы Элизабет Кроппер, которая на основе иконологического анализа идентифицирует модель на портрете как Франческо Гварди. Двойственность интерпретаций, допускающая как медичийские, так и анти-медичийские трактовки образа, объяснена сутью сформировавшейся в середине XVI в. флорентийской абсолютистской культуры, которая ассимилировала бывшие символы республиканской Флоренции и использовала их для прославления герцога Козимо и рода Медичи.

Ключевые слова: портрет, Флоренция, Ренессанс, маньеризм, иконология, Понтормо, Бронзино, Козимо, Медичи



Ill. 134. Jacopo Pontormo. Portrait of a Halberdier. 1529–1530. The J. Paul Getty Museum, Los Angeles. (This image is available for download, without charge, under the Getty's Open Content Program)



Ill. 135. Agnolo Bronzino. Portrait of Cosimo I de' Medici in Armour. 1545. The Uffizi Gallery, Florence. Wikimedia (public domain)



Ill. 136. Agnolo Bronzino. Portrait of a Young Man with a Book. 1530s. The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York. (Met's Open Access policy, public domain)